

# PAB Site Visitor Training Session

## Part II: Outcomes Assessment

# Outline

15

## Part II: Outcomes Assessment

- ▶ Program Improvement Plans
- ▶ Student Learning Outcomes
- ▶ Examples and Q&A throughout

# Learning Outcomes for this Session

16

- ▶ Differentiate between the two **types of outcomes assessment** – program improvement and student learning
- ▶ Identify the components in a **program improvement plan**

# Learning Outcomes for this Session

- ▶ Practice writing program- and course-level **student learning outcomes**
- ▶ Analyze **measurement approaches** and their appropriateness
- ▶ Recognize a good **student learning outcomes assessment plan**
- ▶ Be prepared to **judge the outcomes assessment plans** (program and student learning)

# Outcomes Assessment in Accreditation

Two sets of Outcomes to assess:

- ▶ Health and well-being of the program?
- ▶ Students learning what they will need for entry-level jobs and their careers?

# Why Outcomes Assessment?

19

## Provide Evidence to Track Achievement of Outcomes

- ▶ Establish measurable outcomes
- ▶ Implement plan for collecting relevant information on those outcomes
- ▶ Analyze outcome information
- ▶ Make changes as needed

# Key Issues for Site Visitors

20

- ▶ Understand and appreciate the distinction between program improvement planning **and** student learning outcomes
- ▶ Evaluate efficacy of program goals and learning outcomes in the context of the program's mission

# Key Issues for Site Visitors

21

- ▶ Examine ways by which program seeks to measure outcomes (program improvement goals and student learning)
- ▶ Review assessment plans (measures, data, analysis, feedback – what, how, when, who)
- ▶ Confirm how the program has used AND how it plans to use results to continuously improve

# PROGRAM IMPROVEMENT AND STRATEGIC PLANNING

**ASSESSING PROGRESS/SUCCESS IN  
ACHIEVING PROGRAM GOALS**

# Program Improvement Goals and Assessment

- ▶ What does the program aspire to become? Examples....
  - ▶ Improve in rankings, reputation?
  - ▶ Increase enrollment and resources?
  - ▶ Improved accreditation status, issues addressed in previous site visits, etc.?
  - ▶ Conduct research that improves practice of planning?

# Program Improvement Goals and Assessment

- ▶ What is the plan to get there (strategic plan)?
- ▶ How does the program measure these outcomes (what, when, how)?
- ▶ How does the program use the information from assessment to continue to improve?

# Program Improvement and Assessment - EXAMPLE

## Program Strategic Planning

- ▶ What are your program's goals?
  - ▶ Example, Increase Student Diversity
    - ▶ **Current:** 5% of student headcount is U.S. Hispanic or non-white
    - ▶ **Aspirational:** 20% in 10 years
    - ▶ **Realistic:** 10% in 5 years (planning/action horizon)

# Program Improvement and Assessment - EXAMPLE

- ▶ What are measurable objectives for these goals?
  - ▶ First, describe your plan and its logic:
    - ▶ Increase number of targeted applications from own institution (applicants → students)
    - ▶ Expand market area for recruitment (applicants → students)
    - ▶ Improve retention (factors affecting retention: Student preparation, financial considerations, fit, culture, etc.)

# Program Improvement and Assessment - EXAMPLE

27

- ▶ What are measurable objectives and benchmarks for those goals?
  - ▶ Objective 1: Double number of targeted applicants from own institution for Fall 2016 entering class
  - ▶ Objective 2: Establish working relationships in two new targeted recruitment areas by Spring, 2016
  - ▶ Objective 3: Improve year-to-year retention rates for targeted population by 5% by Fall 2017 census

# Program Improvement Plans and Assessment for PAB

- ▶ Added Requirements
  - ▶ Graduation rates
  - ▶ Retention rates
  - ▶ Employment status after graduation
  - ▶ Cost of attendance

# STUDENT LEARNING OUTCOMES ASSESSMENT

**THE OTHER BIG OUTCOME TO ASSESS**

# Required Elements in a Student Learning Assessment Plan

30

Four things

1. Set of **program-level student learning outcomes** and levels of performance
2. **Curriculum map** that links course-level learning outcomes to program-level outcomes

# Required Elements in a Student Learning Assessment Plan

## Four things

3. List of **measures/evidence** to be collected and how
4. Schedule for **collecting evidence and using the results** to improve student learning

# Required Elements in a Student Learning Assessment Plan

Four things

1. Set of **program-level student learning outcomes** and levels of performance
2. **Curriculum map** that links course-level learning outcomes to program-level outcomes

# Student Learning Outcomes

**Definition:** Student learning outcomes clearly state the expected knowledge, skills, attitudes, competencies, and habits of mind that students are expected to acquire at an institution of higher education.

# How Does “Learning Outcome Orientation” Benefit Students?

- ▶ Provides clear expectations for what they are to learn
- ▶ Clarifies where this learning is to take place
- ▶ Identifies key assessments that are linked to learning outcomes
- ▶ Sets expected performance levels

# Types of Student Learning Outcomes

## ▶ Program-Level

- ▶ *Graduates of the Program will {action verb} {something}*
- ▶ Required in programmatic and institutional accreditation

## ▶ Course-Level

- ▶ *Students who have completed this course, will {action verb} {something}*
- ▶ Building blocks for program-level

# Student Learning Outcomes

## Course-Level

- ▶ ***Students who have completed this course, will {action verb} {something}***
- ▶ Typically linked to course purpose, objectives, and curricular needs
- ▶ Clear statement to students about what they will learn in the course
- ▶ Help define and justify assignments, course content, etc.

# Student Learning Outcomes – Course-Level

Let's Practice...Together

Sample Course Syllabus – description,  
objectives, required work

***“By the end of this course, students will be able to {action verb} {something}.”***

# Planning Theory

(J. Thomas, Univ of Michigan)

- ▶ 14 **course** learning outcomes:
  - ▶ You should *explain functional planning* and its importance in planning U. S. cities
  - ▶ You should be able to *discuss some characteristics/ implications of modernism*
  - ▶ You should be able to *define, describe, and present strengths and weaknesses of the rational planning process*

# Student Learning Outcomes – Program-Level

## Factors affecting Program-Level:

- ▶ What graduates are expected to do and where
- ▶ Current needs and future expectations for professional practice and competence
- ▶ PAB definitions in Standard 4 (knowledge, skills, values/ethics, etc.)

# Student Learning

40

## Outcomes – Program-Level

*The mission of the graduate City and Regional Planning (CRP) program is to provide a professionally-oriented education to a student body with diverse cultural, educational, and professional backgrounds. The CRP program focuses on participatory planning and sustainable, equitable communities, while stressing a multidisciplinary approach. Students graduate equipped with the knowledge of theory, technical capacity, collaborative skills, and critical thinking abilities necessary to plan for economic, environmental, and social justice in urban neighborhoods and metropolitan regions.*

# Student Learning Outcomes – Program-Level

Let's Practice...

***“Graduates of the Program will  
{action verb} {something}.”***

# Student Learning Outcomes – Program-Level

- ▶ List three things graduates of this program would need to **know** by the time they graduate.
  1. Definition of sustainability
  2. Legal and institutional context for planning
  3. Participatory approaches to neighborhood planning

# Student Learning Outcomes – Program-Level

- ▶ For each of these things, write down a verb that would describe the action a student would need to take to be able to demonstrate that knowledge.
  1. Explain [sustainability]
  2. Defend [in legal and institutional context]
  3. Apply [participatory approaches]

{USE BLOOM'S TAXONOMY}

# Student Learning Outcomes – Program-Level

- ▶ List three **skills** you would expect a graduate of this program to demonstrate and an action a student would need to take to be able to demonstrate that skill
  1. Team work – work in teams on an applied project for a community
  2. Run a meeting – demonstrate ability to plan and facilitate a meeting of citizens
  3. Analyze data – determine the level of poverty in the community

# Student Learning Outcomes – Program-Level

- ▶ Typically 7-12 student learning outcomes
- ▶ Often with various subparts
- ▶ Measurable due to the examples of what they are intended to be able to know, do, value

# Required Elements in a Student Learning Assessment Plan

46

Four things

1. Set of **program-level student learning outcomes** and levels of performance
2. **Curriculum map** that links course-level learning outcomes to program-level outcomes

# Curriculum Mapping

47

- ▶ Links course-level learning outcomes to program-level learning outcomes
- ▶ Identifies where learning outcomes are expected
- ▶ Shows you strategies for in-course learning assessment of program-level outcomes

# Curriculum Map

| <b>Program Learning Outcome/ Course</b> | <b>Course A</b> | <b>Course B</b> | <b>Course C</b> | <b>Course D</b> |
|---|-----------------|-----------------|-----------------|-----------------|
| <b>Explain sustainability</b>           |                 |                 |                 |                 |
| <b>Apply participatory approaches</b>   |                 |                 |                 |                 |
| <b>Work in teams effectively</b>        |                 |                 |                 |                 |
| <b>Communicate in writing</b>           |                 |                 |                 |                 |
| <b>#5</b>                               |                 |                 |                 |                 |
| <b>#6</b>                               |                 |                 |                 |                 |

# Curriculum Map

49

| Program Learning Outcome/ Course      | Course A | Course B | Course C | Course D |
|---------------------------------------|----------|----------|----------|----------|
| <b>Explain sustainability</b>         | X        |          | X        | X        |
| <b>Apply participatory approaches</b> |          |          |          |          |
| <b>Work in teams effectively</b>      | X        | X        |          |          |
| <b>Communicate in writing</b>         | X        |          | X        | X        |
| <b>#5</b>                             | X        | X        |          |          |
| <b>#6</b>                             |          | X        | X        | X        |

X = Covered in Course

# Curriculum Map

50

| Program Learning Outcome/ Course | Course A | Course B | Course C | Course D |
|----------------------------------|----------|----------|----------|----------|
| Explain sustainability           | X        |          | X        | X        |
| Apply participatory approaches   | ?        |          |          |          |
| Work in teams effectively        | X        | X        |          |          |
| Communicate in writing           | X        |          | X        | X        |
| #5                               | X        | X        |          |          |
| #6                               |          | X        | X        | X        |

X = Covered in Course

# Curriculum Map

51

| Program Learning Outcome/ Course      | Course A | Course B | Course C | Course D |
|---------------------------------------|----------|----------|----------|----------|
| <b>Explain sustainability</b>         | X        |          | X        | X        |
| <b>Apply participatory approaches</b> |          |          |          |          |
| <b>Work in teams effectively</b>      | X        | X        |          |          |
| <b>Communicate in writing</b>         | X        |          | X        | X        |
| <b>#5</b>                             | X        | X        |          |          |
| <b>#6</b>                             |          | X        | X        | X        |

X = Covered in Course

# Curriculum Map

52

| Program Learning Outcome/ Course      | Course A | Course B | Course C | Course D |
|---------------------------------------|----------|----------|----------|----------|
| <b>Explain sustainability</b>         | X        |          | A        | X        |
| <b>Apply participatory approaches</b> |          |          |          |          |
| <b>Work in teams effectively</b>      | A        | X        |          |          |
| <b>Communicate in writing</b>         | A        |          | X        | X        |
| <b>#5</b>                             | X        | A        |          |          |
| <b>#6</b>                             |          | X        | X        | A        |

X = Covered in Course; A = Covered and Assessed in Course

# Beyond Delivering Courses...

Programs need to demonstrate achievement of student learning outcomes

- ▶ Curriculum, courses, activities provide the **opportunity** to learn....
- ▶ But must **demonstrate** that **students** actually **learned**

**Must:** define outcomes, establish appropriate measures, collect data on a routine basis, and interpret/use results

# Required Elements in a Student Learning Assessment Plan

54

Four things

3. List of **measures/evidence** to be collected and how
4. Schedule for **collecting evidence and using the results** to improve student learning

# Measuring Student Learning Outcomes

Two categories of measures (direct and indirect)

- ▶ Direct are best
  - ▶ Tests/Test items (correct items, scores and pass rates on licensure exams)
  - ▶ Rubrics applied to project or paper (portfolios of student work, capstone projects)
  - ▶ Field supervisor ratings and employer ratings (If ratings address knowledge, skills, and values)

# Measuring Student Learning Outcomes

- ▶ Indirect are easier but flawed:
  - ▶ Course grades (do not distinguish which knowledge, skills, values areas achieved)
  - ▶ Surveys (measure opinions and satisfaction)
  - ▶ Student self-ratings (lack objectivity)
  - ▶ Alumni satisfaction with learning (satisfaction is often subjective)
  - ▶ Honors, awards, scholarships (uncertainty in criteria applied)
- ▶ Multiple measures provide corroborating evidence

# Required Elements in a Student Learning Assessment Plan

57

## Four things

3. List of **measures/evidence** to be collected and how
4. Schedule for **collecting evidence and using the results** to improve student learning

# Measuring Student Learning Outcomes

1. Measure and Level of performance
2. Methods – whom? how often? how many?
3. For what purpose?  
Feedback loop

# Let's look at examples: #1

59

- ▶ Program-Level Outcome: Apply participatory approaches to neighborhood planning
- ▶ Measure: Evaluate student knowledge level compared to “expectations for entry-level planner”
- ▶ Methods and Artifacts: Employer surveys conducted every three years
- ▶ Feedback Loop: Used to adjust course content, experience requirements

# Let's look at examples: #2

60

- ▶ Program-Level Outcome: Ability to write clearly and persuasively
- ▶ Measure: Rubric for written communication (“capstone”)
- ▶ Methods and Artifacts : random sample of 5-8 of capstone/thesis project every year
- ▶ Feedback Loop: Used to adjust curricular content and emphasis on writing

# Let's look at examples: #3

61

- ▶ Program-Level Outcome: Demonstrate application of professional ethics and AICP Code of Ethics
- ▶ Measure: AICP Exam Score in Ethics section (benchmark = passing score)
- ▶ Methods and Artifacts : Analyze section of AICP exam for all graduates taking exam every other year
- ▶ Feedback Loop: Used to adjust teaching approach to ethics

# Learning Outcome Measurement Plan

- ▶ Employer Survey
  - ▶ Topics: Participatory approaches, Legal, institutional issues; Teamwork; Benchmark: Compared to entry-level planners
  - ▶ Every other year
  - ▶ How many? Written/oral survey? Focus-group at APA conference?

# Learning Outcome Measurement Plan

- ▶ AICP exam
  - ▶ Topics: ethics; comprehensive planning
  - ▶ Benchmark: passing score
  - ▶ Every other year
  - ▶ All graduates who take exam that year