PAB Site Visitor Training Session

Part II: Outcomes Assessment
Outline

Part II: Outcomes Assessment

- Program Improvement Plans
- Student Learning Outcomes
- Examples and Q&A throughout
Learning Outcomes for this Session

- Differentiate between the two types of outcomes assessment – program improvement and student learning
- Identify the components in a program improvement plan
Learning Outcomes for this Session

- Practice writing program- and course-level student learning outcomes
- Analyze measurement approaches and their appropriateness
- Recognize a good student learning outcomes assessment plan
- Be prepared to judge the outcomes assessment plans (program and student learning)
Outcomes Assessment in Accreditation

Two sets of Outcomes to assess:

- Health and well-being of the program?
- Students learning what they will need for entry-level jobs and their careers?
Why Outcomes Assessment?

Provide Evidence to Track Achievement of Outcomes

- Establish measurable outcomes
- Implement plan for collecting relevant information on those outcomes
- Analyze outcome information
- Make changes as needed
Key Issues for Site Visitors

- Understand and appreciate the distinction between program improvement planning and student learning outcomes.
- Evaluate efficacy of program goals and learning outcomes in the context of the program’s mission.
Key Issues for Site Visitors

- Examine ways by which program seeks to measure outcomes (program improvement goals and student learning)
- Review assessment plans (measures, data, analysis, feedback – what, how, when, who)
- Confirm how the program has used AND how it plans to use results to continuously improve
PROGRAM IMPROVEMENT AND STRATEGIC PLANNING

ASSESSING PROGRESS/SUCCESS IN ACHIEVING PROGRAM GOALS
Program Improvement
Goals and Assessment

- What does the program aspire to become? Examples....
  - Improve in rankings, reputation?
  - Increase enrollment and resources?
  - Improved accreditation status, issues addressed in previous site visits, etc.?
  - Conduct research that improves practice of planning?
Program Improvement Goals and Assessment

- What is the plan to get there (strategic plan)?
- How does the program measure these outcomes (what, when, how)?
- How does the program use the information from assessment to continue to improve?
Program Improvement and Assessment - EXAMPLE

Program Strategic Planning

► What are your program’s goals?

► Example, Increase Student Diversity

► **Current**: 5% of student headcount is U.S. Hispanic or non-white

► **Aspirational**: 20% in 10 years

► **Realistic**: 10% in 5 years (planning/action horizon)
What are measurable objectives for these goals?

First, describe your plan and its logic:

- Increase number of targeted applications from own institution (applicants → students)
- Expand market area for recruitment (applicants → students)
- Improve retention (factors affecting retention: Student preparation, financial considerations, fit, culture, etc.)
Program Improvement and Assessment - EXAMPLE

What are measurable objectives and benchmarks for those goals?

- Objective 1: Double number of targeted applicants from own institution for Fall 2016 entering class
- Objective 2: Establish working relationships in two new targeted recruitment areas by Spring, 2016
- Objective 3: Improve year-to-year retention rates for targeted population by 5% by Fall 2017 census
Program Improvement Plans and Assessment for PAB

- Added Requirements
  - Graduation rates
  - Retention rates
  - Employment status after graduation
  - Cost of attendance
STUDENT LEARNING OUTCOMES ASSESSMENT

THE OTHER BIG OUTCOME TO ASSESS
Required Elements in a Student Learning Assessment Plan

Four things

1. Set of **program-level student learning outcomes** and levels of performance

2. **Curriculum map** that links course-level learning outcomes to program-level outcomes
Required Elements in a Student Learning Assessment Plan

Four things

3. List of measures/evidence to be collected and how

4. Schedule for collecting evidence and using the results to improve student learning
Required Elements in a Student Learning Assessment Plan

Four things

1. Set of **program-level student learning outcomes** and levels of performance

2. **Curriculum map** that links course-level learning outcomes to program-level outcomes
Student Learning Outcomes

**Definition:** Student learning outcomes clearly state the expected knowledge, skills, attitudes, competencies, and habits of mind that students are expected to acquire at an institution of higher education.

- National Institute for Learning Outcomes Assessment
How Does “Learning Outcome Orientation” Benefit Students?

- Provides clear expectations for what they are to learn
- Clarifies where this learning is to take place
- Identifies key assessments that are linked to learning outcomes
- Sets expected performance levels
Types of Student Learning Outcomes

Program-Level
- Graduates of the Program will {action verb} {something}
- Required in programmatic and institutional accreditation

Course-Level
- Students who have completed this course, will {action verb} {something}
- Building blocks for program-level
Student Learning Outcomes

Course-Level

- *Students who have completed this course, will* {action verb} {something}

- Typically linked to course purpose, objectives, and curricular needs

- Clear statement to students about what they will learn in the course

- Help define and justify assignments, course content, etc.
Student Learning Outcomes – Course-Level

Let’s Practice…Together

Sample Course Syllabus – description, objectives, required work

“By the end of this course, students will be able to {action verb} {something}.”
Planning Theory
(J. Thomas, Univ of Michigan)

14 course learning outcomes:

- You should explain functional planning and its importance in planning U. S. cities
- You should be able to discuss some characteristics/implications of modernism
- You should be able to define, describe, and present strengths and weaknesses of the rational planning process
Student Learning Outcomes – Program-Level

Factors affecting Program-Level:

- What graduates are expected to do and where
- Current needs and future expectations for professional practice and competence
- PAB definitions in Standard 4 (knowledge, skills, values/ethics, etc.)
Student Learning Outcomes – Program-Level

The mission of the graduate City and Regional Planning (CRP) program is to provide a professionally-oriented education to a student body with diverse cultural, educational, and professional backgrounds. The CRP program focuses on participatory planning and sustainable, equitable communities, while stressing a multidisciplinary approach. Students graduate equipped with the knowledge of theory, technical capacity, collaborative skills, and critical thinking abilities necessary to plan for economic, environmental, and social justice in urban neighborhoods and metropolitan regions.
Student Learning Outcomes – Program-Level

Let’s Practice...

“Graduates of the Program will {action verb} {something}.”
Student Learning Outcomes – Program-Level

- List three things graduates of this program would need to **know** by the time they graduate.
  1. Definition of sustainability
  2. Legal and institutional context for planning
  3. Participatory approaches to neighborhood planning
Student Learning Outcomes – Program-Level

For each of these things, write down a verb that would describe the action a student would need to take to be able to demonstrate that knowledge.

1. Explain [sustainability]
2. Defend [in legal and institutional context]
3. Apply [participatory approaches]

{USE BLOOM’s TAXONOMY}
List three **skills** you would expect a graduate of this program to demonstrate and an action a student would need to take to be able to demonstrate that skill

1. Team work – work in teams on an applied project for a community
2. Run a meeting – demonstrate ability to plan and facilitate a meeting of citizens
3. Analyze data – determine the level of poverty in the community
Student Learning Outcomes – Program-Level

- Typically 7-12 student learning outcomes
- Often with various subparts
- Measurable due to the examples of what they are intended to be able to know, do, value
Required Elements in a Student Learning Assessment Plan

Four things

1. Set of **program-level student learning outcomes** and levels of performance

2. **Curriculum map** that links course-level learning outcomes to program-level outcomes
Curriculum Mapping

- Links course-level learning outcomes to program-level learning outcomes
- Identifies where learning outcomes are expected
- Shows you strategies for in-course learning assessment of program-level outcomes
## Curriculum Map

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Program Learning Outcome/ Course</th>
<th>Course A</th>
<th>Course B</th>
<th>Course C</th>
<th>Course D</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Explain sustainability</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Apply participatory approaches</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Work in teams effectively</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Communicate in writing</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>#5</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>#6</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
## Curriculum Map

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Program Learning Outcome/ Course</th>
<th>Course A</th>
<th>Course B</th>
<th>Course C</th>
<th>Course D</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Explain sustainability</td>
<td>X</td>
<td></td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Apply participatory approaches</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Work in teams effectively</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Communicate in writing</td>
<td>X</td>
<td></td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>#5</td>
<td>X</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>#6</td>
<td></td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

*X = Covered in Course*
## Curriculum Map

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Program Learning Outcome/ Course</th>
<th>Course A</th>
<th>Course B</th>
<th>Course C</th>
<th>Course D</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Explain sustainability</td>
<td>X</td>
<td></td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Apply participatory approaches</td>
<td></td>
<td>?</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Work in teams effectively</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Communicate in writing</td>
<td>X</td>
<td></td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>#5</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>#6</td>
<td></td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

X = Covered in Course
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Program Learning Outcome/ Course</th>
<th>Course A</th>
<th>Course B</th>
<th>Course C</th>
<th>Course D</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Explain sustainability</td>
<td>X</td>
<td></td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Apply participatory approaches</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>?</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Work in teams effectively</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Communicate in writing</td>
<td>X</td>
<td></td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>#5</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>#6</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

X = Covered in Course
## Curriculum Map

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Program Learning Outcome/ Course</th>
<th>Course A</th>
<th>Course B</th>
<th>Course C</th>
<th>Course D</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Explain sustainability</td>
<td>X</td>
<td></td>
<td>A</td>
<td>X</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Apply participatory approaches</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Work in teams effectively</td>
<td>A</td>
<td>X</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Communicate in writing</td>
<td>A</td>
<td></td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>#5</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>A</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>#6</td>
<td></td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>A</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

X = Covered in Course; A = Covered and Assessed in Course
Beyond Delivering Courses...

Programs need to demonstrate achievement of student learning outcomes

- Curriculum, courses, activities provide the **opportunity** to learn....

- But must **demonstrate** that **students** actually learned

**Must:** define outcomes, establish appropriate measures, collect data on a routine basis, and interpret/use results
Required Elements in a Student Learning Assessment Plan

Four things

3. List of measures/evidence to be collected and how

4. Schedule for collecting evidence and using the results to improve student learning
Measuring Student Learning Outcomes

Two categories of measures (direct and indirect)

- Direct are best
  - Tests/Test items (correct items, scores and pass rates on licensure exams)
  - Rubrics applied to project or paper (portfolios of student work, capstone projects)
  - Field supervisor ratings and employer ratings (If ratings address knowledge, skills, and values)
Measuring Student Learning Outcomes

- Indirect are easier but flawed:
  - Course grades (do not distinguish which knowledge, skills, values areas achieved)
  - Surveys (measure opinions and satisfaction)
  - Student self-ratings (lack objectivity)
  - Alumni satisfaction with learning (satisfaction is often subjective)
  - Honors, awards, scholarships (uncertainty in criteria applied)

- Multiple measures provide corroborating evidence
Required Elements in a Student Learning Assessment Plan

Four things

3. List of measures/evidence to be collected and how

4. Schedule for collecting evidence and using the results to improve student learning
Measuring Student Learning Outcomes

1. Measure and Level of performance

2. Methods – whom? how often? how many?

3. For what purpose? Feedback loop
Let's look at examples: #1

- Program-Level Outcome: Apply participatory approaches to neighborhood planning
- Measure: Evaluate student knowledge level compared to “expectations for entry-level planner”
- Methods and Artifacts: Employer surveys conducted every three years
- Feedback Loop: Used to adjust course content, experience requirements
Let’s look at examples: #2

- **Program-Level Outcome**: Ability to write clearly and persuasively
- **Measure**: Rubric for written communication (“capstone”)
- **Methods and Artifacts**: Random sample of 5-8 of capstone/thesis project every year
- **Feedback Loop**: Used to adjust curricular content and emphasis on writing
Let’s look at examples: #3

- **Program-Level Outcome:** Demonstrate application of professional ethics and AICP Code of Ethics

- **Measure:** AICP Exam Score in Ethics section (benchmark = passing score)

- **Methods and Artifacts:** Analyze section of AICP exam for all graduates taking exam every other year

- **Feedback Loop:** Used to adjust teaching approach to ethics
Learning Outcome
Measurement Plan

- Employer Survey
  - Topics: Participatory approaches, Legal, institutional issues; Teamwork;
  Benchmark: Compared to entry-level planners
  - Every other year
  - How many? Written/oral survey? Focus-group at APA conference?
Learning Outcome Measurement Plan

- AICP exam
  - Topics: ethics; comprehensive planning
  - Benchmark: passing score
  - Every other year
  - All graduates who take exam that year